CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 25, 2010 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Salvador Aréchiga	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Ann Jarmusch	Absent
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary

Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR January 28, 2010 and February 26, 2010

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 28, 2010 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini Vote: 5-0-1 Motion Passes

(Silvas)

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR ARÉCHIGA TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 26, 2010 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini Vote: 5-0-1 Motion Passes

(Berge)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES

Boardmembers Jarmusch, Curry, Bethke, and Marrone have notified Staff that they cannot attend today's meeting.

OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

- ✓ Applicant's request for continuance for Item 7 Johnson's Wilshire Gas Station
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Chair Lemmo declared a conflict of interest with Item 5-2901 5th Avenue.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The adopted HRB policy on evaluation of Ranch Style architecture was repealed by the Board at its workshop on March 13, 2010. The Modernism Context Statement will be used in its place to evaluate Ranch style architecture.
- Staff is currently accepting nominations for the Board's annual historic preservation awards. Forms are located on the side table and can be accessed on our website at www.sandiego.gov/historic. The deadline for nominations is Friday, April 2, 2010. Please spend a minute and think of a project or person who deserves recognition for excellence in historic preservation. Awards will be presented at the May 27, 2010 HRB meeting.
- A Special Meeting of the Archaeology Subcommittee has been scheduled for Monday, March 29, 2010 at 4:00 PM.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 5, 2010. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, April 12, 2010.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services; a CCDC development permit review; 3 individual homeowner nominations and the HRB Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee. This agenda includes 1 continued item from November 2009. There are 40 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, 21 homeowner nominations in 2009, and 3 homeowner nominations in 2010 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 25, 2010 Page 3 of 6

• Those owners whose property was designated in 2009 or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2010. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2010 to be considered this year.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Applicant has submitted a written request for a continuance for Item 7 – Johnson's Wilshire Gas Station

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 30-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 7 – JOHNSON'S WILSHIRE GAS STATION AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- ITEM 6 STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE HRB SITE#887 located at 1037 15th Street
- ITEM 8 PAGE MANOR/WALTER KELLER HOUSE located at 3580 Jennings Street
- ITEM 9 DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1 located at 3221 Homer Street
- ITEM 10 –QUALITY BUILDING AND SECURITIES COMPANY SPECULATIVE HOUSE #1 located at 3036 Elliott Street
- ITEM 11 HRB AD-HOC INCENTIVES SUBCOMMITTEE

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge pulled Item 9 from the consent agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 6, 8, 10 AND 11 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 2901 5th AVENUE

Continued from November 2009

Applicant: Palm Properties LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2901 5th Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2901 5th Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 2901 5th Avenue as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated March 12, 2010, Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009, HRB-08-028 and HRB 07-042

TRAILED FOR 30-DAYS DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 25, 2010 Page 4 of 6

ITEM 6 – STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE HRB SITE#887

Applicant: Raul Valderrama, Rachel Lucero and Rebecca Jones represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1037 15th Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 3-C**)

<u>Description</u>: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: The Historical Resources Board recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit related to the designated historical resource as presented.

Report Number: HRB-10-006

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 7 – JOHNSON'S WILSHIRE GAS STATION

Applicant: Sabah Y. Toma, Janan T. Toma, Latif C. Marogy and Faiza M. Marogy represented by Archaeos

<u>Location</u>: 4689 Market Street, 92102, Encanto Neighborhoods Community, Council District 4 (**1289 3-J**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4689 Market Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate Johnson's Wilshire Gas Station located at 4689 Market Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1962 under HRB Criterion C. The recent convenience store building is excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-10-012

CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 8 – PAGE MANOR/WALTER KELLER HOUSE

Applicant: Courtier Escalante Revocable Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3580 Jennings Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 3-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3580 Jennings Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Page Manor/Walter Keller House located at 3580 Jennings Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-10-013

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 -DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1

Applicant: Cynthia & Brian Daugherty

Location: 3221 Homer Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-D)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3221 Homer Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 located at 3221 Homer Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1915 under HRB Criterion C and Criterion D.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 25, 2010 Page 5 of 6

Report Number: HRB-10-014

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: David Marshall

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge would like a physical copy of the Notice of Completion to be included in the file; it was referenced but not included in the report. She would have liked to have seen the photos of the Dryden two-story houses in Valley Vista that were referenced in the Covington journal article; it was not clear if they were included or not. A two-story building is notable for Dryden; she doesn't question Criterion D. Feels there needs more documentation and information for Criterion C, particularly as it relates to a potential front porch.

Boardmember Garbini questions the building's integrity; flat front looks like it is missing something. Side of the building has a real pretty design look, but the front doesn't look completed. Questions what was there originally and the box beam on the front.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga wants to how they are going to take care of the brick on the porch and if there was a covered porch originally. He has seen both covered and open front porches on two-story homes.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1 UNDER CRITERION D PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1 UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods Vote: 4-2-0 Motion Fails

(Berge, Garbini)

ITEM 10 – QUALITY BUILDING AND SECURITIES COMPANY SPECULATIVE HOUSE #1

Applicant: Delaine Davis represented by Johnson & Johnson Architecture

Location: 3036 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 7-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3036 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Quality Building and Securities Company Speculative House #1 located at 3036 Elliott Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-015

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 25, 2010 Page 6 of 6

ITEM 11 - HRB AD-HOC INCENTIVES SUBCOMMITTEE

Applicant: HRB Policy Subcommittee and CPCI Department

Location: N/A

Description: Consider dissolving the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee

Today's Action: Dissolve the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee, or do not dissolve the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee and return the item to the Policy Subcommittee with comments.

Staff Recommendation: Dissolve the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee and refer three priority items, the Preservation Fund, Land Development Code revisions, and Transfer of Development Rights program, to the Policy Subcommittee for completion.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated March 16, 2010 and HRB-10-011

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, April 22, 2010 City Administration Building 12th Floor, Council Committee Room **LOCATION**:

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 1:46 PM